

## PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Wednesday, 30 July 2014

**Minutes of the meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee held at the Guildhall EC2 at 11.00 am**

### **Present**

#### **Members:**

Deputy Michael Welbank (Chairman)	Christopher Hayward
Oliver Lodge (Deputy Chairman)	Gregory Jones QC
Randall Anderson	Paul Martinelli
Alex Bain-Stewart	Sylvia Moys
David Bradshaw	Graham Packham
Deputy John Chapman	Deputy Henry Pollard
Emma Edhem	Angela Starling
Marianne Fredericks	Patrick Streeter

#### **Officers:**

Christopher Braithwaite	Committee and Member Services Officer
Sarah Roberts	Committee & Members Services Assistant
Julie Smith	Chamberlain's Department
Deborah Cluett	Comptroller and City Solicitor's Department
Philip Everett	Director of the Built Environment
Paul Beckett	Department of the Built Environment
Annie Hampson	Department of the Built Environment
Steve Blake	
Peter Davenport	

### **1. APOLOGIES**

Apologies for absence were received from Deputy Ken Ayers, Dennis Cotgrove, Alderman Peter Estlin, Sophie Fernandes, Deputy Bill Fraser, George Gillon, Brian Harris, Deputy Henry Jones, Deputy Keith Knowles, Alderman Neil Redcliffe, Graeme Smith and Deputy James Thomson.

### **2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

Randall Anderson, David Bradshaw and Angela Starling all declared non-pecuniary interests in item 4 due to being residents of the Barbican Estate.

Alex Bain-Stewart declared a non-pecuniary interest in respect of item 3b due to being personally acquainted with one of the objectors.

Marianne Fredericks declared a non-pecuniary interest in respect of item 3b due to having previously sat on a Licensing Hearing in relation to 200 Aldersgate.

### 3. REPORTS RELATIVE TO PLANNING APPLICATIONS

#### 3.1 51 - 54 Fenchurch Street, London, EC3M 3LA

**Registered Plan No.:** 14/00363/FULMAJ

**Proposal** - Demolition of existing building and re-development of the site for a new ten storey office (Class B1(a)) building with use of part of the ground floor for provision of 2 units (one unit Class A1/A3 retail and the other unit for Class A1/A3 retail or Class B1(a) offices), roof top and basement M&E plant, provision of waste storage, basement cycle parking, realignment and reprovision of Star Alley and associated highway works and other works incidental to the proposals (6,334sq.m).

During discussion, reference was made to the following:-

- that there was not likely to be any member of the public negatively impacted by the realignment and reprovision of Star Alley; and
- that the on-street servicing of the building would need to be carefully monitored.

**RESOLVED – That:**

- a) Planning permission be granted for the above proposal in accordance with the details set out in the attached scheduled, subject to Planning Obligations and other agreements being entered into as set out in the body of this report, the decision notice not to be issued until such obligations have been executed;
- b) Officers be instructed to negotiate and execute obligations in respect of those matters set out in "Planning Obligations" under Section 106 and any necessary agreements under Section 278 of the Highway Act 1980;
- c) it be agreed in principle that the public highway forming part of Star Alley described in the report may be stopped-up to enable the development to proceed and, upon receipt of the formal application, officers be instructed to proceed with arrangements for advertising and making of a stopping-up Order for those areas, under the delegation arrangements approved by the Court of Common Council; and
- d) the area of land proposed to be dedicated as replacement public highway as described in the report be agreed.

#### 3.2 Unit 3 200 Aldersgate Street, London, EC1A 4HD

**Registered Plan No.:** 14/00291/FULL

**Proposal:** Installation of extract louvres on Aldersgate Street elevation and rear elevation to external courtyard area; installation of condenser units within rear courtyard area associated with the use of unit 3 for restaurant (A3) use, and associated relocation of cycle rack.

Daniel James spoke against the application and the Director of Built Environment read a statement against the application from Jono Collins, who was unable to attend this meeting on its revised date. Barnaby Collins was heard in reply.

During discussion, reference was made to the following:

- the likely level of noise disruption to local residents, both in terms of level of noise and types of noise;
- whether there was sufficient room for an appropriate fire evacuation route;
- the proposed locations for the air intake and extraction of the building;
- the need for conditions to be placed on any operating hours for the extraction unit;

A motion was put by Alex Bain-Stewart and seconded by David Bradshaw that a condition be added to the recommendation within the report that the operating hours for the extraction unit be limited between 12am and 7am.

Upon being put to vote, the motion was carried –

Vote: 9 in favour, 0 against.

Members then put the question of the planning permission, including the additional condition, to vote, and planning permission was refused –

Vote: 5 in favour, 7 against, 1 abstention.

**RESOLVED** – That Planning permission be refused on the grounds of detrimental impact on residential amenity. Specifically, the Committee rejected the proposals because, notwithstanding the favourable technical evaluation contained in the report of the air conditioning plant and the noise and odour control measures, the Committee considers that there is a high probability of adverse impacts on neighbouring residents and this risk should not be accepted. This view was bolstered by:

- the applicant's representative not being able to answer many of the questions put to him by the Committee;
- alternative locations being available for this equipment which would overcome this risk, which had not been shown to be unfeasible; and
- there being other uses for this property with valid planning permissions.

4. **BARBICAN LISTED BUILDING MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES – VOLUME IV – LANDSCAPE SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING DOCUMENT**

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Planning Officer and Development Director which sought approval for the draft text of the Barbican Listed Building Management Guidelines Draft SPD to be published for formal consultation in August/September 2014.

**RESOLVED** – That the draft text of the Barbican Listed Building Management Guidelines Draft SPD, Volume IV, and Parts 2 (good practice guidance) and 3

(green infrastructure), appended as Annex A to this report be published for formal public consultation in August/September 2014.

5. **CITY OF LONDON RESPONSES TO CONSULTATIONS ON THE PROPOSED GARDEN BRIDGE BETWEEN TEMPLE STATION AND THE QUEEN'S WALK**

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Planning Officer and Development Director regarding the Corporation's responses to consultations on the proposed Garden Bridge between Temple Station and The Queen's Walk.

The Committee commented on the proposed consultation response, and requested that the response be amended to:

- place more emphasis upon the concerns that the proposed bridge will have a significant negative impact upon night time views, particularly those of St Paul's Cathedral;
- request that a condition be made to the planning permission to limit the permissible height of the vegetation;
- request clarification to ensure that the construction of the proposed bridge would not impact upon the Lord Mayor's Show;
- Westminster Council and Lambeth Council be requested to respond to the issues raised in the City's consultation response to allow the City to consider this response and determine whether further representations would need to be made.

**RESOLVED** - That the detailed comments as set out in the report and as amended in line with the comments made at the meeting be forwarded to the London Borough of Westminster and the London Borough of Lambeth, following approval by the Chairman and Deputy Chairman.

6. **REPORTS OF THE DIRECTOR OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT**

6.1 **Paternoster Square City Walkway Public Access**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment which discussed the options for public access through the Paternoster Square development, including Paternoster Square and the surrounding lanes and alleys.

The Committee discussed the implications of declaring the land to be a City walkway in relation to both the maintenance of the Square and the ability to remove protesters in the event of any protests similar to the Occupy movement, which it was noted had been very well handled by the owners of the Square.

**RESOLVED** – That:

- a) Paternoster Square, Paternoster Lane, Paternoster Row, Canon Alley, Queen's Head Passage, Rose Street and White Hart Street shown hatched black on city walkway declaration plan CWDP - 01 - 08 at Appendix 2 to this report be declared as City Walkway in accordance

with the resolution annexed at Appendix 1 to this report subject to the limitations contained in the agreement described in recommendation (C) below;

- b) the Town Clerk be authorised to insert an appropriate date for the coming into force of this resolution;
- c) the Comptroller and City Solicitor be authorised to enter into an agreement with the owner of the land to be declared to be a city walkway to provide for the city walkway to be subject to limitations enabling the public right of way and of access to be temporarily suspended to the extent and for the minimum period that is required for any or all of the following purposes:—
  - (a) In the interests of public safety or security, where the need is first confirmed by a chief officer of the City of London Corporation or by an officer of the City of London Police holding at least the rank of superintendent; other than in cases of imminent threat, where such confirmation must be obtained within six hours of the suspension coming into force (or the suspension must cease).
  - (b) To permit works of maintenance, repair or renewal of the city walkway subject to prior approval from the City of London Corporation, which must be requested not less than 28 days prior to the proposed date of suspension; save in the case of emergency or de minimis works requiring less than 4 hours' suspension of access, which works must be notified to the City within 48 hours of such suspension coming into force.
  - (c) Force majeure.

## **6.2 Sugar Quay, Lower Thames Street, London EC3R 6EA**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment regarding Sugar Quay, Lower Thames Street, London and the Affordable Housing contribution from proposed residential development.

**RESOLVED – That,**

- a) the value of the second instalment of the affordable housing payment be agreed at £7,503,408; and
- b) subject to the developer not agreeing to this amount, the matter be referred to an independent expert for advice on the value of the second instalment.

## **6.3 Adoption of draft Office Use Supplementary Planning Document as Interim Planning Guidance**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment regarding the adoption of the draft Office Use Supplementary Planning Document as Interim Planning Guidance.

**RESOLVED** - That the revised draft Office Use Supplementary Planning Document be adopted as Interim Planning Guidance, from today's date, pending adoption of the Local Plan.

#### 6.4 **On-Street Parking Pay & Display**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment regarding On-Street Parking: Pay and Display.

**RESOLVED** – That:

- a) the usage and location of P&D machines be reviewed by Officers with a view to reducing and optimising the overall number;
- b) the credit and debit card payment at the P&D machines be removed encouraging customers to use PaybyPhone, but retaining the option to pay by cash at the machine;
- c) the Pay & Display maintenance contract with FAAC (UK) Ltd (trading as ZEAG Parking Ltd) be extended by 2 years from 29 September 2014 ending 28 September 2016;
- d) Verrus UK Ltd (trading as PaybyPhone) contract be extended by 2 years from 27 November 2014 ending on 28 November 2016;
- e) the Comptroller and City Solicitor be instructed to prepare the appropriate documentation for the contract extensions in respect of ZEAG UK Ltd and PaybyPhone; and
- f) a programme for replacing machines with a modern alternative be considered with full cost proposals presented to Members later in the year.

#### 6.5 **Review of Guidelines for Special Events**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment which summarised the findings of a review of the current procedure for considering applications to hold major special events in the Square Mile.

Members extended their congratulations to officers for a very sound piece of work.

The Committee also considered a resolution from the Culture, Heritage and Libraries Committee which stated that the Chairman and Deputy Chairman of that Committee be appointed to the Officer Events Group with immediate effect. The Chairman stated that it was not appropriate for any Members to be appointed to an officer group, which the Committee with, and reiterated that this did not accord with what had been agreed by the Policy & Resources Committee, which set out that the Chairmen and Deputy Chairmen of the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Culture, Heritage and Libraries Committee would be consulted on special events.

**RESOLVED** – That:

- a) the Planning and Transportation Committee do not agree to the proposal for the appointment of the Chairman and Deputy Chairman

of the Culture, Heritage and Libraries Committee to the Officer Events Group.

- b) the proposals for a revised Special Events consideration process be agreed;
- c) the revised fees and charging structure be agreed;
- d) the changes to the Children's Parade event, which will be subject to a full post-event review be noted;**
- e) support be given to the Royal Marines Parade; and**
- f) the application for the 'Walk a Mile in Her Shoes' event be accepted.**

**7. REVENUE OUTTURN 2013-14**

The Committee received a joint report of the Chamberlain, Director of the Built Environment, Director of Culture, Heritage and Libraries and the City Surveyor in relation to the Revenue Outturn for 2013/2014.

A Member stated that he felt that the outturn was an optimistic position, and particularly noted that Blackfriars Bridge was likely to need some significant work to repair corroded ironwork.

**RESOLVED** – That the revenue outturn report for 2013/14 and the proposed carry forward of underspendings to 2014/15 be noted.

**8. STREET TRADING POLICY**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection regarding the Street Trading Policy.

The Committee discussed the City Corporation's powers in relation to the seizure of unlicensed ice cream vans, and the level of charges made to small traders for temporary licences for City events.

A Member noted that one of the factors used to determine the granting of temporary street trading licences should be the impact upon existing ratepaying business. The Director of Markets and Consumer Protections stated that this was included as part of the Policy.

**RESOLVED** - That the report be noted.

**EXTENSION OF THE MEETING**

At this point, the time limit for Committee meetings as set out in Standing Order No 40 had been reached, but there being a two-thirds majority of the Committee present who voted in favour of an extension, the Committee agreed to continue the meeting.

**9. TABLES & CHAIRS POLICY**

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer protection which sought approval of the Tables and Chairs Policy.

**RESOLVED** – That the proposed Policy as detailed at Appendix 1 to the report be approved.

10. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

**RESOLVED** – That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of the Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

11. **DEBT ARREARS - DEPARTMENT OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT - PERIOD ENDING 31/03/2014**

The Committee noted a report of the Director of the Built Environment which informed the Committee of arrears of invoiced income as at 31 March 2014.

12. **TOWER BRIDGE GLASS PANELS**

The Committee noted a report of the Director of the Built Environment regarding the detailed design and the authority to start work on the Tower Bridge Glass Panels.

13. **QUESTIONS**

Members asked questions in relation to the work of the Committee.

**The meeting closed at 1.15 pm**

-----  
Chairman

**Contact Officer: Christopher Braithwaite**  
**tel. no.: 020 7332 1427**  
**christopher.braithwaite@cityoflondon.gov.uk**